

Nationalism and Human Rights

Emir Yazici
Ph.D. Candidate
Department of Political Science
University of Missouri
113 Professional Building
Columbia MO 65211
eyvwf@mail.missouri.edu

Supplemental Materials: Sample, Robustness Tests, and Data for Case Study

Table 1: Sample

Country	Time Range		Country	Time Range	
Albania	1981	2011	South Korea	1981	2011
Armenia	1981	2011	Latvia	1992	2011
Australia	1981	2011	Lithuania	1992	2011
Austria	1981	2011	Luxembourg	1981	2011
Azerbaijan	1992	2011	Macedonia	1993	2011
Belgium	1981	2011	Malta	1981	2011
Bulgaria	1981	2011	Mexico	1981	2011
Canada	1981	2011	Moldova	1992	2011
Croatia	1992	2011	Netherlands	1981	2011
Cyprus	1981	2011	New Zealand	1981	2011
Czech Rep.	1991	2011	Norway	1981	2011
Denmark	1981	2011	Poland	1981	2011
Estonia	1992	2011	Portugal	1983	2011
Finland	1981	2011	Romania	1981	2011
France	1981	2011	Russia	1992	2011
Georgia	1992	2011	Slovakia	1993	2011
Germany	1981	2011	Slovenia	1992	2011
Greece	1981	2011	South Africa	1981	2011
Hungary	1981	2011	Spain	1981	2011
Iceland	1981	2011	Sweden	1981	2011
Ireland	1981	2011	Switzerland	1981	2011
Israel	1981	2011	Turkey	1981	2011
Italy	1981	2011	Ukraine	1992	2011
Japan	1981	2011	United Kingdom	1981	2011
United States	1981	2011			
Total: 49					

Table 2: Nationalism and Human Rights in Partial Democracies (GLS)

	Electoral Self-Determination	Freedom of Speech	Freedom of Assembly and Association	Disappearance	Extrajudicial Killing	Torture	Political Imprisonment
Average Nationalism Score	-0.132*** (-5.95)	-0.041* (-1.67)	-0.111** (-2.57)	-0.016 (-0.94)	-0.016 (-0.47)	-0.010 (-0.72)	-0.110*** (-3.48)
Population	-0.378*** (-4.60)	-0.056 (-0.65)	-0.108 (-0.68)	-0.275*** (-6.31)	-0.088 (-0.57)	-0.277*** (-3.53)	-0.386** (-2.74)
GDP	0.231*** (3.43)	-0.088 (-1.42)	0.047 (0.41)	0.088*** (3.86)	-0.044 (-0.38)	0.105* (1.80)	0.131 (1.31)
Conflict	-0.176** (-2.51)	-0.190** (-2.57)	-0.171* (-1.92)	-0.316** (-2.96)	-0.435*** (-3.50)	-0.009 (-0.22)	-0.207* (-1.72)
Refugee Population	-0.035** (-2.38)	0.003 (0.47)	0.001 (0.04)	-0.000 (-0.07)	-0.015 (-0.59)	0.013 (1.13)	0.006 (0.33)
Constant	1.935** (2.57)	3.920*** (7.94)	1.797* (1.67)	4.090*** (5.23)	3.985*** (3.54)	2.095*** (4.45)	4.007*** (4.05)
Observations	113	113	113	113	113	113	113

t statistics in parentheses

* $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.001$

Table 3: Nationalism and Human Rights in Full Democracies (GLS)

	Electoral Self-Determination	Freedom of Speech	Freedom of Assembly and Association	Disappearance	Extrajudicial Killing	Torture	Political Imprisonment
Average Nationalism Score	-0.001 (-0.26)	0.002 (0.61)	-0.000 (-0.40)	-0.000 (-0.05)	-0.000 (-0.07)	-0.002 (-0.25)	-0.000 (-0.14)
Population	-0.046** (-2.41)	-0.321*** (-11.55)	-0.242*** (-19.86)	-0.004 (-0.45)	-0.042** (-2.15)	-0.579*** (-13.99)	-0.074** (-3.07)
GDP	0.052** (2.77)	0.294*** (10.41)	0.220*** (21.23)	0.002 (0.42)	0.017 (1.00)	0.389*** (9.10)	0.061** (2.85)
Conflict	-0.005 (-0.34)	0.003 (0.07)	0.050 (0.83)	-0.012 (-0.28)	-0.411*** (-3.38)	-0.117 (-1.31)	-0.803*** (-6.04)
Refugee Population	-0.002 (-1.13)	-0.002 (-0.35)	0.012*** (10.64)	-0.000 (-0.17)	0.000 (0.15)	0.056*** (6.67)	0.001 (0.58)
Constant	1.381*** (6.75)	-1.025** (-2.51)	-0.120 (-0.78)	1.995*** (26.01)	2.206*** (11.31)	-0.180 (-0.33)	1.526*** (6.04)
Observations	720	720	720	720	720	720	720

t statistics in parentheses

* $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.001$

Table 4: Nationalism and Human Rights in Partial Democracies (xtsc)

	Electoral Self-Determination	Freedom of Speech	Freedom of Assembly and Association	Disappearance	Extrajudicial Killing	Torture	Political Imprisonment
Average Nationalism Score	-0.168*** (-6.77)	-0.132** (-4.38)	-0.156** (-3.65)	-0.053 (-1.10)	-0.033* (-2.13)	-0.040 (-1.40)	-0.157*** (-6.80)
Population	-0.422*** (-4.59)	-0.144 (-1.20)	-0.380* (-1.94)	-0.324** (-2.32)	-0.114 (-0.74)	-0.546** (-3.52)	-0.253 (-1.76)
GDP	0.317*** (5.60)	0.058 (0.53)	0.276 (1.58)	0.136 (1.40)	-0.009 (-0.08)	0.321** (2.58)	0.069 (0.56)
Conflict	-0.343** (-2.49)	-0.358** (-4.39)	-0.469** (-2.83)	-0.198 (-1.01)	-0.434** (-4.00)	-0.175 (-1.37)	-0.594** (-3.08)
Refugee Population	-0.021 (-1.27)	0.048*** (4.51)	0.060** (2.80)	0.010 (0.35)	-0.012 (-0.41)	0.032** (3.19)	0.026 (0.90)
Constant	0.533 (0.82)	1.681 (1.56)	0.176 (0.13)	3.563** (3.39)	3.497** (3.91)	0.985 (0.95)	3.405* (2.15)
Observations	113	113	113	113	113	113	113

t statistics in parentheses

* $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.001$

Table 5: Nationalism and Human Rights in Full Democracies (xtscc)

	Electoral Self-Determination	Freedom of Speech	Freedom of Assembly and Association	Disappearance	Extrajudicial Killing	Torture	Political Imprisonment
Average Nationalism Score	-0.013 (-0.63)	0.009 (0.52)	-0.005 (-0.41)	0.026** (2.55)	-0.002 (-0.11)	-0.017 (-0.63)	0.016 (1.62)
Population	-0.300*** (-4.85)	-0.319*** (-9.81)	-0.318*** (-4.81)	-0.086*** (-5.27)	-0.334*** (-9.36)	-0.631*** (-18.29)	-0.231*** (-3.69)
GDP	0.322*** (5.16)	0.322*** (9.57)	0.300*** (4.82)	0.010 (0.44)	0.291*** (6.34)	0.452*** (8.46)	0.152** (2.26)
Conflict	-0.229** (-2.62)	0.112 (0.71)	-0.429** (-2.44)	-0.282 (-1.25)	-0.674** (-3.36)	-0.294** (-2.79)	-0.903*** (-5.11)
Refugee Population	-0.008 (-1.27)	-0.032*** (-4.47)	0.002 (0.24)	0.029** (3.53)	-0.018*** (-3.84)	0.060** (3.39)	0.048*** (4.86)
Constant	-1.687** (-2.38)	-1.555*** (-4.38)	-1.007 (-1.58)	2.767*** (8.29)	-0.261 (-0.41)	-0.998 (-1.26)	1.129 (1.41)
Observations	721	721	721	721	721	721	721

t statistics in parentheses

* $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.001$

Table 6: Nationalism and Human Rights in Partial Democracies with Coalition Governments

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
	Freedom of Assembly and Association	Electoral Self-Determination	Freedom of Speech	Disappearance	Extrajudicial Killing	Torture	Political Imprisonment
Average Nationalism Score	-0.424** (-2.88)	-0.598*** (-4.77)	-0.494*** (-4.93)	0.242** (2.95)	-0.122 (-1.36)	-0.105 (-0.75)	-0.493*** (-4.16)
Population	0.160 (0.70)	-0.433** (-2.01)	-0.636** (-3.23)	-0.774** (-2.46)	-0.488** (-3.25)	-0.072 (-0.24)	-0.212 (-0.82)
GDP	-0.522** (-2.08)	0.244 (1.03)	0.566** (2.67)	0.795** (2.31)	0.623*** (3.84)	-0.070 (-0.22)	0.433 (1.52)
Conflict	0.082 (0.21)	0.949** (2.53)	0.502** (2.12)	-0.900*** (-5.17)	-0.322 (-1.30)	0.042 (0.11)	0.957** (2.32)
Refugee Population	0.095* (1.93)	-0.055 (-1.38)	0.090** (2.64)	0.067* (1.69)	0.036 (0.87)	0.054 (1.11)	-0.053 (-1.04)
Constant	11.029*** (3.87)	3.060 (1.22)	-2.963 (-1.39)	-6.052 (-1.38)	-6.151** (-2.78)	2.898 (0.83)	-5.042 (-1.61)
Observations	28	28	28	28	28	28	28

t statistics in parentheses

* $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.001$

Table 7: Nationalism and Human Rights in Full Democracies with Coalition Governments

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
	Freedom of Assembly and Association	Electoral Self-Determination	Freedom of Speech	Disappearance	Extrajudicial Killing	Torture	Political Imprisonment
Average Nationalism Score	-0.021 (-0.55)	-0.010 (-0.44)	-0.015 (-0.86)	-0.012 (-1.00)	0.033 (1.55)	-0.054 (-0.72)	-0.090* (-1.84)
Population	-0.091 (-0.41)	-0.301*** (-4.90)	-0.312*** (-4.01)	-0.124* (-1.67)	-0.141 (-1.02)	-0.728*** (-4.61)	-0.328* (-1.94)
GDP	0.115 (0.54)	0.307*** (4.51)	0.303*** (3.68)	0.019 (0.28)	0.146 (1.31)	0.539*** (3.48)	0.252* (1.87)
Conflict	-0.366* (-1.70)	-0.068 (-1.11)	0.044 (0.30)	0.091 (1.19)	-1.001*** (-8.56)	-0.517 (-0.91)	-1.925*** (-15.7)
Refugee Population	0.091** (2.72)	-0.003 (-0.21)	-0.026 (-1.55)	0.004 (0.25)	-0.010 (-0.45)	0.063* (1.80)	-0.036 (-1.53)
Constant	-0.506 (-0.24)	-1.322 (-1.60)	-1.218 (-1.24)	3.349** (2.71)	0.413 (0.37)	-1.639 (-0.91)	0.898 (0.57)
Observations	129	721	721	129	129	129	129

t statistics in parentheses

* $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.001$

Table 8: Nationalism and Human Rights in Partial Democracies (DPI)

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
	Freedom of Assembly and Association	Electoral Self-Determination	Freedom of Speech	Disappearance	Extrajudicial Killing	Torture	Political Imprisonment
Chief Executive Party: Nationalist	0.347 (1.48)	-0.144 (-0.64)	-0.023 (-0.12)	-0.257* (-1.72)	0.411** (2.18)	0.450** (2.35)	0.495* (1.92)
Population	0.142 (0.67)	-0.224 (-1.22)	-0.031 (-0.18)	-0.299* (-1.88)	0.083 (0.55)	-0.200 (-1.34)	0.081 (0.35)
GDP	-0.096 (-0.60)	0.169 (1.21)	-0.039 (-0.31)	0.083 (0.69)	-0.180 (-1.57)	0.057 (0.50)	-0.059 (-0.36)
Conflict	-0.241* (-1.73)	-0.265** (-2.09)	-0.230* (-1.83)	-0.374** (-2.82)	-0.286** (-2.22)	-0.028 (-0.33)	-0.521*** (-3.91)
Refugee Population	0.017 (0.53)	0.008 (0.27)	0.025 (1.00)	0.016 (0.67)	-0.037 (-1.38)	0.028 (1.22)	-0.039 (-1.25)
Constant	1.108 (0.82)	0.536 (0.47)	2.240** (2.39)	4.380*** (3.55)	4.667*** (4.71)	1.896** (2.38)	1.533 (1.29)
Observations	143	143	143	143	143	143	143

t statistics in parentheses

* $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.001$

Table 9: Nationalism and Human Rights in Full Democracies (DPI)

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
	Freedom of Assembly and Association	Electoral Self-Determination	Freedom of Speech	Disappearance	Extrajudicial Killing	Torture	Political Imprisonment
Chief Executive Party: Nationalist	0.056 (0.47)	-0.039 (-0.23)	-0.194 (-1.64)	-0.255*** (-4.66)	-0.065 (-0.82)	0.025 (0.17)	-0.012 (-0.082)
Population	-0.286** (-3.17)	-0.336*** (-5.12)	-0.297*** (-4.01)	-0.186* (-1.71)	-0.198*** (-3.70)	-0.644*** (-12.0)	-0.258*** (-3.78)
GDP	0.265** (2.74)	0.330*** (4.53)	0.291*** (3.65)	0.079 (0.75)	0.141** (2.58)	0.406*** (6.34)	0.243** (3.21)
Conflict	-0.779*** (-3.66)	-0.244 (-1.35)	-0.147 (-0.58)	-0.079 (-0.39)	-1.116*** (-5.52)	-0.569*** (-3.74)	-1.231*** (-5.94)
Refugee Population	0.025 (1.34)	0.001 (0.053)	-0.040** (-2.04)	-0.008 (-0.80)	-0.006 (-0.48)	0.082*** (4.89)	-0.013 (-0.83)
Constant	-0.791 (-0.68)	-1.430 (-1.64)	-1.035 (-1.04)	2.861** (2.45)	1.402** (2.02)	0.174 (0.20)	-0.295 (-0.31)
Observations	623	623	623	623	623	623	623

t statistics in parentheses

* $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.001$

Table 10: Turkish Governments (1999 - 2016)

Year	Chief Executive	Chief Executive's Party	Government Type	Nationalism Score	Freedom of Assembly and Association	Electoral Self-Determination	Freedom of Speech	Disappearance	Extrajudicial Killing	Torture	Political Imprisonment	Democracy Level	Interstate Conflict	Intrastate Conflict	Refugee Population (logged)	GDP (logged)
1999	Bulent Ecevit	Democratic Left Party	Coalition	0.235	1	1	1	1	0	0	0	7	0	1	7.942718	27.37549
2000	Bulent Ecevit	Democratic Left Party	Coalition	0.235	0	1	0	2	0	0	0	7	0	1	8.040125	27.44104
2001	Bulent Ecevit	Democratic Left Party	Coalition	0.235	1	1	1	1	1	0	0	7	0	1	8.152486	27.38238
2002	Bulent Ecevit	Democratic Left Party	Coalition	0.235	1	1	1	1	1	0	0	7	0	1	8.101981	27.44219
2003	Recep Tayyip Erdogan	Justice and Development Party	Single-Party	0.100	1	1	0	2	1	0	0	7	0	1	7.820038	27.4935
2004	Recep Tayyip Erdogan	Justice and Development Party	Single-Party	0.100	1	1	0	2	1	0	0	7	0	1	8.017307	27.583
2005	Recep Tayyip Erdogan	Justice and Development Party	Single-Party	0.100	1	1	0	2	0	0	0	7	0	2	7.782807	27.66368
2006	Recep Tayyip Erdogan	Justice and Development Party	Single-Party	0.100	1	1	0	2	1	0	0	7	0	1	7.875879	27.73034
2007	Recep Tayyip Erdogan	Justice and Development Party	Single-Party	0.415	1	1	0	2	1	0	0	7	0	1	8.84736	27.77597
2008	Recep Tayyip Erdogan	Justice and Development Party	Single-Party	0.415	0	0	0	2	0	0	0	7	0	1	9.314971	27.78253
2009	Recep Tayyip Erdogan	Justice and Development Party	Single-Party	0.415	0	1	1	2	0	0	0	7	0	1	9.244741	27.73307
2010	Recep Tayyip Erdogan	Justice and Development Party	Single-Party	0.415	0	1	0	2	1	0	0	7	0	1	9.213535	27.82069
2011	Recep Tayyip Erdogan	Justice and Development Party	Single-Party	0.415	0	1	1	2	0	0	0	9	0	1	9.579487	27.90478
Year	Chief Executive	Chief Executive's Party	Government Type	Nationalism Score	Civil Liberties Score (Freedom House) (1: Best, 7: Worst)							Democracy Level	Interstate Conflict	Intrastate Conflict	Refugee Population (logged)	GDP (logged)
2012	Recep Tayyip Erdogan	Justice and Development Party	Single-Party	0.238	4							9	0	1		
2013	Recep Tayyip Erdogan	Justice and Development Party	Single-Party	0.238	4							9	0	1		
2014	Recep Tayyip Erdogan	Justice and Development Party	Single-Party	0.238	4							3	0	1		
2015	Ahmet Davutoglu	Justice and Development Party	Single-Party	0.518	4							3	0	1		
2016	Binali Yildirim	Justice and Development Party	Single-Party	0.516	5							-4	0	1		

Nationalism and Human Rights - Coding Rules for Turkey Case (1999-2016) - Chief Executive = The chief executive who served at least 6 months in a given year between 1999-2016.
Nationalism Score:

- Key words/phrases: positive mentions of nationalism, national interests/benefits, national security, national unity, national culture, national solidarity, national history, national priorities, national ideals, and external ethnic kin.
- After searching for keywords, I hand-coded each sentence to decide whether they are positive mentions of nationalism. I calculated the percentage of the number of the words in the sentences favoring nationalism in the total number of words in the speech.
- If there is any negative mention of nationalism (anti-nationalist narrative), it is subtracted from the number of words of positive mentions to get a more accurate value representing nationalism score of the chief executive/government.
- If there are more than one speech in a given year, I used the mean of the scores for these speeches.
- If there is no speech in a given year according to the criteria above, the last available speech is used to determine the nationalism score of the chief executive in a given year.
- I specifically used presentation of government program at the national assembly by the chief executives. Even if a government consists multiple parties (coalition governments), these speeches reflect the entire government's ideology. Also, these speeches are perfectly comparable given their similar audience, length, and content. I used the official archives of the Grand National Assembly of Turkey (<https://www.tbmm.gov.tr/tutanak/tutanaklar.htm>) to find the original speeches. I excluded the speeches if they are exclusively technical (budget talks) which would have very few mentions of nationalism (if any) or speeches on national holidays which are inherently nationalist independently from government party's ideology. In total, I coded 8 speeches.